Characterization of natural monatin isomers, a high intensity sweetener from the 
plant *Sclerochiton ilicifolius* from South Africa

Vinesh J. Maharaj *, Nivan Moodley,*, Hans Vahrmeijer,§

*a*Department of Chemistry, University of Pretoria, Private Bag X20, Hatfield 0028, Pretoria, South Africa

*b*CSIR Biosciences, Box 395, Pretoria, 0001, South Africa

§ILIFA Knowledge Systems, P.O. Box 1711, Bela-Bela, 0480, South Africa

*Corresponding author. Tel.: +27 12 420 3095; fax: +27 12 420 4687.

E-mail addresses: vinesh.maharaj@up.ac.za

**Highlights**

• Marfey's derivatization method and HPLC MS was used to separate monatin enantiomers.

• Both the $2S,4S; 2R,4R$ enantiomeric pair was present in extracts of *S. ilicifolius*.

• The $2S,4S; 2R,4R$ isomers were present in *S. ilicifolius* collected at different seasons.
ABSTRACT

The objective was to establish the natural occurrence of the various isomers of monatin in extracts of *Sclerochiton ilicifolius* plant material harvested from different growing regions in South Africa. The natural occurrence of the $2S,4S$ isomer has been reported as well as the synthesis of the $2R,4R$ isomer. The $2R,4R$ is reported as the most intense sweetness however its natural occurrence has not been fully reported, as a result it was not possible to establish whether these isomers are indeed already present in the plant or come from racemisation during the processing of the plant. The presence of the monatin isomers $2S,4S; 2R,4R$ in aqueous extracts of *S. ilicifolius* root bark was demonstrated in each sample harvested at two different time points. The $2R,4R, 2S,4S, 2R,4S,$ and $2S,4R$ monatin isomers were absent in the aqueous extracts of *S. ilicifolius* stem and leaf samples, however was shown to be present in the root bark, and root core samples. This report confirms previous findings which suggested that the $2S,4S$ and $2R,4R$ monatin isomers occur naturally in *S. ilicifolius*.

KEY WORDS

Monatin, Natural, Isomeric Distribution, *Sclerochiton ilicifolius*, South Africa, Plant Characterization, Chiral
1. INTRODUCTION

Monatin, (Indol-3-yl)-2-amino-4-carboxy-4-hydroxypentanoic acid (Figure 1), is a naturally occurring high intensity sweetener isolated from the bark of the roots of *Sclerochiton ilicifolius*, a spiny-leafed hardwood shrub growing in the rocky hills of the Limpopo Province in South Africa (Vleggaar et al., 1992). The same authors also assigned the 2S,4S absolute configuration to the natural levorotatory compound based on NOE NMR experiments on a cyclic derivative and the application of the empirical Clough–Lutz–Jirgenson rule. The crystal structure of synthetic 2R,4R monatin potassium salt dehydrate was only recently determined by single crystal X-ray structure analysis (Amino et al., 2016). The relative sweetness of the 2S,4S monatin isolated from the natural plant was reported in 1992 to be 1200 to 1400 fold more intense than that of sucrose however synthetic 2R,4R monatin, was reported much later to have a more intense sweetness than the 2S,4S isomer i.e. up to 2700 times that of 5% sucrose (Patent No. WO2003059865 A1, 2003). Monatin is compatible with other sweeteners and forms acceptable blends for example with aspartame. Extensive in vivo toxicology studies for 2R,4R monatin have also been completed moving it closer towards commercialization (Brathwaite et al., 2011, Brathwaite et al., 2014, Brathwaite et al., 2016, Brathwaite et al., 2016). The low concentration of monatin in the root bark has challenged scientists to develop processes to produce natural monatin in sizeable quantities for commercial use. While the synthesis of all four monatin stereo isomers has been reported the natural occurrence of the three remaining stereo isomers was demonstrated in an extract of the plant (Bassoli et al., 2005). However these scientists have referenced that owing to the small amounts available and the impossibility of obtaining a larger sample or information about the exact origin and detailed extraction
methodology, it was not possible to establish whether these isomers are indeed already present in the plant or come from some racemisation during the processing of the sample and suggested that this should be further investigated. This study focused on determining the natural occurrence of monatin stereo isomers in minimally processed extracts through appropriate, sustainable, controlled harvesting procedures, extraction and analysis.

![Diagram of monatin isomers](image)

**Figure 1.** $2S,4S$ and $2R,4R$ stereoisomers of monatin

As a member of the plant family Acanthaceae, *S. ilicifolius* has been referred to as 'Molomo monate' from the Sepedi name meaning “mouth nice” (Vleggaar et al., 1992). Based on actual herbarium specimens housed in the South African National Biodiversity Institute (SANBI) in Pretoria, information on plant availability is limited. The ‘epicentre’ of the distribution of *S. ilicifolius* is the Waterberg area in the Limpopo province of South Africa. The second ‘main’ area of distribution is the Zoutpansberg, a mountain range in northern Limpopo, and a third area in the Blyde River Canyon Nature Reserve near the Abel Erasmus Pass in the Mpumalanga Province.
2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 Chemicals and reagents

The reagents ammonium acetate, sodium bicarbonate and hydrochloric acid were purchased from Saarchem Univar, Marfey’s reagent purchased from Pierce, Rockford, IL, USA, Cat # 48895). HPLC grade acetone and acetonitrile was purchased from Burdick and Jackson (ACS/HPLC grade).

2.2 Plant material harvesting

Initial collections in September 2002 focused on the harvesting of representative samples of the root bark at each of the collection sites for the main purpose to establish the presence of the isomers, while representative portions of roots, stems, and leaves were also harvested in later collections (February 2005) to also establish the presence of monatin isomers in the other plant parts. All samples were delivered to the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) for further processing. Plant identification was done at the time of the collection of the research material by Hans Vahrmeijer, a registered professional Botanist (Reg. No. 400182/83 South African Council for Natural Scientific Professions). A voucher specimen was deposited in the herbarium of the SANBI (Voucher No. 00675).

2.3 Processing of plant material.

All samples harvested were separately processed. For the 2002 collections, samples were immediately dried in an oven preset at 60°C. After 48 hours the samples were removed for further processing and the root samples were debarked while the root bark
retained for further processing. Each sample (10-15 g) was separately ground in a high speed blender. The dried ground root bark was extracted by adding 75 ml of purified water to each of the samples. The mixture was allowed to stand at ambient temperature for 4 hours and shaken manually by hand every 30 minutes. Each of the mixtures was separately centrifuged and the supernatant decanted. The water layer was transferred to freeze drying tubes and separately freeze dried overnight. The dried powder was transferred to pre-weighed labelled vials and stored at 4 °C prior to analysis.

For the 2005 collection, the stems, leaves samples and root samples were transferred to trays and immediately dried in an oven preset at 60°C. After 48 hours the samples were removed for further processing. The leaves were stripped and separately retained for further processing. The roots were debarked and the root bark and roots retained for further processing. Each sample was separately ground in a high speed blender. The sample was extracted by adding 200 ml of de-ionized water and the mixture was allowed to stand at ambient temperature for 4 hours and shaken manually by hand every 30 minutes. Each of the mixtures was separately filtered through filter paper, the water layer transferred to freeze drying tubes and separately freeze dried. The dried powder was transferred to pre-weighed labelled vials and stored at 4°C prior to analysis.

### 2.4 Preparation of standards

Monatin synthetic standards, $2S,4S$; $2R,4R$ and mixture of RS/SR stereoisomers used for the characterization in the plant materials were prepared prior at the CSIR as described in literature (Rousseau et al., 2011). The standards were available at the CSIR for this research.
2.5 Chiral chromatography for separation of Monatin enantiomers using Marfey’s derivatization procedure (Marfey et al., 1984).

100 µl of a monatin standards in 10 mg/ml solution was mixed with 200 µl of 1 % Marfey’s reagent and 40 µl of 1 M sodium bicarbonate. The mixture was shaken and reacted at 40 °C for 1 hour. After cooling to room temperature 20 µl of 2 M hydrochloric acid was added. For analysis, the derivatization mixture was diluted 100:1 (20 µl : 2 ml) in water.

Approximately 15 mg of freeze-dried extract was weighed into a vial. 100 µl of water, 200 µl of 1% Marfey’s reagent and then 40 µl of 1 M sodium bicarbonate was added in that order. The mixture was mixed vigorously using a vortex mixer and ultrasonication, and then reacted at 40 °C for 1 hr. After cooling to room temperature 20 µl of 2 M hydrochloric acid was added. 200 µl of the derivatized mixture was diluted with 1800 µl of water and filtered for analysis.

The Chiral Method also referred to as “Marfey’s”, was done employing Waters Alliance 2690 HPLC, with a Quattro Micromass mass spectrometer. Compound separation was accomplished using a 250mm x 4.6mm reversed phase C\textsubscript{18} column (Phenomenex Luna; 5µm particle) protected by a guard column under binary gradient elution conditions (0.05% ammonium acetate/H\textsubscript{2}O and 100% acetonitrile). The flow rate was set to 1.0mL/Min, and the column temperature set to 40°C. Mass spectra were collected across the \textit{m/z} range of 400-600 in negative-ion electrospray mode, and UV spectra were collected from 193-400nm. Peaks on HPLC-MS chromatograms from
different plant extracts were identified as Marfey’s derivatives of monatin if their retention times and mass were the same as those of standards, and if the \((M - H)^-\) ion at \(m/z\) 543 as well as the \((M-H-H_2O)^-\) at \(m/z\) 525 were present. The elution times of the isomers were established by analyzing the two set standards of \(2S,4S\) and \(2R,4R\) enantiomers together, and the \(2R,4S\) and \(2S,4R\) enantiomers together.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Plant harvesting and processing

A summary of the locations of root samples harvested during September 2002 and that for the recollections from same locations during February 2005 is shown in Table 1. Even though there was a three year period between the collections, sufficient material was still available for the recollections.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnobotanist identification</th>
<th>Sample ID - Name / description of site</th>
<th>Harvest date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-38 , Schoongelegen in Vaalwater; Limpopo province of South Africa, single plant on rocky outcrop</td>
<td>September 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-29, Weidehoek in Ellisras, Limpopo province of South Africa</td>
<td>September 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-35, Buffelshoek in Thabazimbi, Limpopo province of South Africa</td>
<td>September 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-32, Schoongelegen in Vaalwater, Limpopo province of South Africa</td>
<td>September 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-47A1-2, Buffelshoek in Thabazimbi, Limpopo province of South Africa</td>
<td>February 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-48A1-2, Schoongelegen in Vaalwater, Limpopo province of South Africa</td>
<td>February 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius</td>
<td>Mon I-50A1-2, Weidehoek in Ellisras Limpopo province of South Africa</td>
<td>February 2005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2 Analysis of separated diastereomers (RR/SS and RS/SR).

The separated 2S,4S and 2R,4R isomers and the mixture of the 2R,4S and 2S,4R isomer standards were analysed using the Marfey’s chiral method. The separated 2S,4S and 2R,4R isomers gave chromatograms with single major peaks corresponding to each of the separated isomers while the 2R,4S and 2S,4R isomer standards yielded chromatograms with two major peaks corresponding to each of the isomers and only minor peaks at the retention times of any of the other isomers (i.e. 2S,4S and 2R,4R). (Figures 2A, 2B, 2C, 2D, 2E, and 2F). The mass spectra of the Marfey’s derivatives of monatin agreed with the known molecular weight (C_{23}N_{6}O_{10}H_{24}, MW = 544, (M – H)^- at m/z 543) and showed a neutral loss of 18 (H_{2}O) confirming the presence of the quaternary hydroxyl group in the molecule. The retention times for the Marfey’s derivatives of the 2R,4S and 2S,4R isomer standards is shown in Table 2. This is the first chromatographic separation of monatin isomers using Marfey’s derivatization procedure as most reported separation of the monatin stereoisomers has generally been done through the use of chiral HPLC (Bassoli et al., 2005, Amino et al., 2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monatin isomer</th>
<th>Retention time of Marfey’s derivative of monatin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2R,4R</td>
<td>23.06 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2S,4S</td>
<td>20.05 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2R,4S and 2S,4R mixture</td>
<td>21.31 min and 25.82 min.*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*may be interchanged for the isomers
Figure 2A. Total ion chromatogram of 2S,4S monatin derivative

Figure 2B. Mass spectrum of 2S,4S monatin derivative

Figure 2C. Total ion chromatogram of 2R,4R monatin derivative
Figure 2D. Mass spectrum of 2R,4R monatin derivative

Figure 2E. Total ion chromatogram of 2S,4R/2R,4S monatin derivatives

Figure 2F. Mass spectrum of 2S,4R/2R,4S monatin derivatives
3.3 Sample extracts.

Those compounds in the single ion chromatograms at $m/z$ 543 which showed the same molecular ion and a neutral loss of 18 ($H_2O$) as the derivatized monatin standards, were identified and their retention times compared to the derivatized standards. Results of the analysis of samples from the initial harvesting and recollection are shown in Tables 3 and 4, respectively.

**Table 3: Summary of Initial Harvesting Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plant Identification and collection area</th>
<th>Plant Part</th>
<th>Retention time (min.) of peak which corresponds to the 2S,4S isomer</th>
<th>Retention time (min.) of peak which corresponds to the 2R,4R isomer</th>
<th>Retention time (min.) of peaks which corresponds to the 2S,4R/2R,4S isomers</th>
<th>Presence of monatin Isomers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Sclerochiton ilicifolius;</em> (Schoongelegen single plant on rocky outcrop)</td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>20.40</td>
<td>23.30</td>
<td>24.21 (trace)</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S/2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sclerochiton ilicifolius;</em> (Weidehoek)</td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>20.01</td>
<td>22.99</td>
<td>21.17 (trace)</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S/2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sclerochiton ilicifolius;</em> (Buffelshoek)</td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>19.94</td>
<td>23.02</td>
<td>21.17 (trace)</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S/2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sclerochiton ilicifolius;</em> (Schoongelegen)</td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>20.33</td>
<td>23.30</td>
<td>Maybe present but in trace quantities as neutral loss of 18 not clearly detected</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: Summary of Re-Harvesting Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plant Identification</th>
<th>Plant Part</th>
<th>Presence of monatin Isomers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leaves</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stems</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius; Buffelshoek in Thabazimbi</td>
<td>Leaves</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stems</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius; Schoonjgelegen in Vaalwater</td>
<td>Leaves</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stems</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sclerochiton ilicifolius; Weidehoek in Ellisrus</td>
<td>Leaves</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stems</td>
<td>ND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Root Bark</td>
<td>2R,4R and 2S,4S monatin detected Trace quantities of 2R,4S and 2S,4R detected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ND not detected

Since the results were very similar for all the sampled sites, a representative total and single-ion chromatograms and their mass spectra of compounds at m/z 543 for a representative sample collected from Buffelshoek in Thabazimbi (Mon I-35) is shown in Figures 3A and 3B using the Marfey’s chiral method. In addition, the total and single-ion chromatograms and their mass spectra of compounds m/z 543 for sample Mon I-29 derivatized aqueous root extract which was spiked with 2S,4S monatin standard prior to injection on the HPLC is shown in Figures 4A and 4B. The purpose of this was to demonstrate the similarity of the compound with m/z 543 eluting at 20.26 minutes in the derivatized extract to the 2S,4S monatin standard as co-elution of a compound m/z 594 appeared in most of the derivatized extracts with the same retention time as the 2S,4S monatin standard.
**Figure 3A.** Single ion $m/z$ 543 and total ion chromatograms of Mon I-35 derivatized

Retention time 23.02 min. corresponding to $2R,4R$ monatin isomer

Retention time 19.94 min. corresponding to the $2S,4S$ monatin isomer

**Figure 3B.** Mass spectrum of compounds with $m/z$ 543 in sample Mon I-35 derivatized
The monatin isomers could not be detected in the leaves and stems of *S. ilicifolius*. The identification of the presence of the monatin isomers is based on two criteria; retention time and molecular mass. The retention times of Monatin peaks from samples were always within 1.75% (less than 22 seconds) of the retention times of 2S,4S monatin standard and 1.04% (less than 15 seconds) of the 2R,4R monatin standard. This minor
variation was also seen for the spiking experiments and within the same ranges for both
the isomers. The mass spectra of the \((M - H)^-\) ion with a neutral loss of 18 (H\(_2\)O) were
the same for standards and samples, and the mass spectra agreed with the expected
molecular mass of the monatin derivatives also indicating that the variations in retention
time was minor. The results proved the presence of the 2\(R\),4\(R\), 2\(S\),4\(S\), 2\(R\),4\(S\), and
2\(S\),4\(R\) monatin isomers in aqueous extracts of \(S.\) \textit{ilicifolius} roots and root bark using the
LC-MS detection of the deprotonated negative molecular ion for the Marfey’s reagent
and confirmed the findings of Bassoli et al. (2005).

The 2\(R\),4\(S\) and 2\(S\),4\(R\) isomers were present in the root and root bark extracts at trace
concentrations, which excluded the production of either of the homochiral isomers due
to epimerisation of the diastereomers unless mediated enzymatically. Elution of single
isomer standards as single peaks demonstrated the absence of significant alteration of
either the 2\(S\),4\(S\) or 2\(R\),4\(R\) isomer to any of the other isomers.

The results of this study has shown that the 2\(S\),4\(S\) and 2\(R\),4\(R\) isomers of monatin occur
naturally in minimally processed aqueous extracts from the root bark of \(S.\) \textit{ilicifolius}
collected from three different sites in the Limpopo Province in South Africa. Previous
studies by both Bassoli et al. (2005) and Amino et al. (2016) have shown repeatedly
that the sweetness profile between these two enantiomers is vastly different and is
analogous to studies in terpenoids where it has been verified that different enantiomers
of the same molecule may possess different properties including odor characteristics,
odor thresholds and even biological activities (Lina et.al., 2017). This finding was
somewhat surprising in that only the 2\(S\),4\(S\) isomer of monatin was found in samples in
the earlier report by Vleggaar et al. (1992). The study also concludes the 2S,4S and 2R,4R isomers are also much more prevalent in the plant versus the 2R,4S and 2S,4R isomers.

ABBREVIATIONS USED
SANBI - South African National Biodiversity Institute
CSIR – Council for Scientific and Industrial Research

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT
We are grateful to the CSIR for supporting and funding this research.

REFERENCES


